



TLP PLUS - 2019

TEST - 19
SYNOPSIS

GS - 4

Table of Contents

Q1. (a) Expand upon the concept of 'ethics in public administration'. Discuss its significance in law driven governance. (150 words) (10)3

(b) Define the following terms with the help of suitable examples: (200 words) (10)4

Probity.....4

Conscience.....4

Persuasion.....4

Q2. Given below are two quotations of moral thinkers/philosophers. For each of these, bring out what it means to you in the present context:5

(a) "There is only one good, knowledge, and one evil, ignorance." (150 words) (10)5

(b) "Educating the mind without educating the heart is no education at all." (150 words) (10)5

Q3. (a) What is emotional awareness? How does emotional awareness help in managing emotions effectively? Illustrate. (150 words) (10)6

(b) What role does persuasion and social influence play in public administration. Illustrate. (150 words) (10)7

Q4. (a) Nobody gets to be good at something without effort, no matter what your aptitude is. Comment. (150 words) (10).....8

(b) The best index to a person's character is how he treats people who can't do him any good, and how he treats people who can't fight back. Comment. (150 words) (10)9

Q5. Given below are two quotes by moral philosophers. Bring out their significance in the present societal context. (150 words) (10)..... 10

(a) "All differences in this world are of degree, and not of kind, because oneness is the secret of everything." 10

(b) "Don't limit a child to your own learning, for he was born in another time." 11

Q6. A good work culture is simply a shared way of doing something with a passion. Elucidate. Do government bodies lack such culture? Examine. (150 words) (10) 12

Q7. People's indifference is the best breeding ground for corruption to grow. Do you agree? Critically analyze. (150 words) (10) 13

Q8. What are your views on subsidies and caste based entitlements? Is it morally correct to tax or deprive one segment of the population and pass on the benefit to the other? Critically examine. (150 words) (10)..... 14

SECTION - B..... 15



SECTION-A

Q1. (a) Expand upon the concept of 'ethics in public administration'. Discuss its significance in law driven governance. (150 words) (10)

Introduction

Public Administration deals with implementation of policies and service delivery to citizens. Hence due to its essential nature it must be guided by certain core values. Ethics, in public administration, is the practice of doing good while performing Civil Duties. It refers to taking a course of action in compliance with rules or code of conduct established for such an administrative work along with making moral judgments, which are based on discretion.

Body

The actions must be manifested based on human values like honesty, impartiality, integrity, diligence, economy, respect for both – law and people along with effectiveness, responsiveness, and accountability.

- **Transparency and Accountability:** In order to earn people's trust, it is important that not only the process is honest but it must also appear so. Also, when each person is responsible for his actions, it brings more efficiency into the system. Hence these qualities improve both quality and quantity of the work done by public administration. Such values translate into steps like Right to Information, Citizen Charter, etc.
- **Objectivity and Impartiality:** A variety of people from different walks of life deal with Public Administration. They come from different backgrounds and exert influence on public administration. Hence it becomes imperative that there are no favoritism or prejudices, so that each person may get their due. Such values translate into steps like online government tenders.
- **Empathy and Compassion:** Many individuals from weaker and oppressed sections of the society are completely dependent upon government welfare. Sometimes they lack proper knowledge of the process, their rights and duties. Public Administration must be patient and caring towards such individuals. Such values translate into steps like Disable-Friendly Government Building.

Significance in law driven governance:

- To discharge official duty with responsibility, honesty, accountability and without discrimination.
- To guarantee effective management, leadership development and personal growth.
- To avoid misuse of official position or information.

- To serve as instruments of good governance and foster social economic development.
- Bring merit into organisation. thereby, increasing predictability, which improves economic efficiency

Conclusion

Strengthening moral and ethical values in governance is essential to achieve such high moral conduct by public servants.

(b) Define the following terms with the help of suitable examples: (200 words) (10)

Probity

- Probity is the act of strict adherence to the highest principles and ideals (integrity, good character, honesty, decency) rather than avoiding corrupt or dishonest conduct. It balances service to the community against the self-interest of individuals.
- Eg: Not clearing faulty files of local goons or politicians and not accepting corruption for it.

Conscience

- Conscience is a person's moral sense of right or wrong. It is the 'inner voice' which makes us feel remorse when we commit actions that go against our moral values and feeling of pleasure of pleasure and wellbeing when our actions, thoughts and words are in conformity to our value system. It is shaped by one's beliefs and values, social environment, family and culture.
- E.g – conscience of someone who is an ascetic may be different from someone who is a hedonist.

Persuasion

- Persuasion is a method of changing a person's cognitions, feelings, behaviours, attitudes toward some object, issue, or person, through some kind of communication.
- Eg: success of the initiatives like Swacch Bharat Abhiyaan- cleanliness drives and UjjwalaYojana's give it up campaign.

Cognitive attitude

- Cognitive component: this involves a person's belief / knowledge about an attitude object.
- It is an evaluation of the entity that constitutes an individual's opinion (belief/disbelief) about the object
- Eg: generalities or stereotypes, such as 'all babies are cute', 'smoking is harmful to health' etc.

Q2. Given below are two quotations of moral thinkers/philosophers. For each of these, bring out what it means to you in the present context:

(a) "There is only one good, knowledge, and one evil, ignorance." (150 words) (10)

Introduction

"The only good is knowledge and the only evil is ignorance" quote by Socrates reveals the importance of knowledge. Socrates was proponent of knowledge and wisdom.

Body

- Ignorance here refers to thinking oneself as knowledgeable or thinking one is too knowledgeable to accept other ideas.
- Education enables a person to acquire knowledge and convert this knowledge into wisdom. And this wisdom act as a guide to take ethical decisions.
- On the other hand, lack of knowledge leads to ignorance and we may be unable to evaluate our actions in the light of ethicality. Our lack of foresight due to ignorance leads us to immoral and bad decisions.
- For example, people who do not vaccinate their children considering it against their religion, are harming their children as well as those of others by not taking the simple step of vaccination. Only knowledge can remove such abhorrent practices.
- One has to be cautious with the approach towards his knowledge attainment. A blocked mind owing to ignorance always generates stale ideas. One's mind needs to be receptive and acknowledge different ideas, like the bed of free flowing river which rejoices the current passing over it.

Conclusion

Knowledge helps in moral evolution. The more one gains knowledge his attitude shifts from simple hedonism and fear of law based morality to social contract and universal morality. Ignorance on the other hand promotes bias and dogma.

(b) "Educating the mind without educating the heart is no education at all." (150 words) (10)

Introduction

The above quote by Aristotle reveals the importance of proper education. Even Gandhiji stressed Education as a means of character development than mere rote learning.

Body

Learning is not education but merely a beginning of education process. Education has deeper meaning, it seeks to develop an **all round personality** who is better equipped to understand and deal with the complexities of outer world, human relations & emotions, humanity at large and able to participate in the process of making the society better, harmonious, conscientious and modern.

A great example of this was **Adolf Hitler**. Hitler was a genius, intellectually speaking; he had a great, analytical, strategic mind, was an avid reader and just generally was extremely bright. He was also a narcissist, a sociopath, a cold, unfeeling, intolerant specimen who did terrible, unspeakable thing with the intellect and the education that he had.

Educating only mind means we are able to develop only cognition. But, educating the heart signifies developing empathy, compassion, respect for diversity & human dignity, love, respect for the law of the land etc. That would entail learning about and appreciating the wisdom of philosophy, ethics, morality, societal values, the beauty of art, literature, poetry, and music. Developing cognition only will lead at best of making human robots not human beings.

Unfortunately, today Education has been reduced to just learning of predefined facts. The ideal values sought to be secured to an educated individual are completely absent and this has manifested itself in the form of hate crimes, terrorism, crimes against humanity etc. Education system shall do away with the utilitarian approach where only aim of education is to get jobs etc. and shall strive to secure this true education to an individual where she can proudly claim that she is educated both at her mind and heart.

Conclusion

Finally, when good teaching reaches both the mind and heart of a student; he applies it and it remains there for the rest of his life, then the goal of education is perfectly realised.

Q3. (a) What is emotional awareness? How does emotional awareness help in managing emotions effectively? Illustrate. (150 words) (10)

Introduction

Emotional awareness is defined as our ability to recognize and control our own emotional states, while also being mindful of the emotional states of those around us. People having this competency are more aware of their feelings and performance.

Body

Emotional awareness helps in managing emotions effectively such as:

- It promotes Optimism which means persistence in pursuance of goals despite all hurdles. Optimistic people are able to deal with any kind of setbacks and obstacles.
- **Self-control:** This involves management of all disruptive emotions and impulses. People who are able to control themselves are more calm, positive and focussed
- **Empathy:** This means sensing feelings and emotions of others and taking an active interest in their perceptions and perspectives. Such people are very responsive to emotional cues and listen to everything well
- **Service orientation:** This involves anticipating, recognising and meeting the needs of the customers. Thus, it caters to matching products and service s according to needs of the customers to maximise customer satisfaction and loyalty.
- **Developing others:** This means gauging what others need in order to boost their confidence. People who develop others often acknowledge and reward other's strengths, accomplishments and development.
- **Team capabilities:** This involves creation of group synergy in pursuance of collective goals. People with this competence are able to model team qualities like respect, helpfulness and cooperation. This helps in drawing all group members into active and enthusiastic participation.

Conclusion:

Emotional awareness is an important determinant of our social well-being, success and holistic development of all individuals.

(b)What role does persuasion and social influence play in public administration. Illustrate. (150 words) (10)

Introduction

To effectively implement the public policy, active participation of citizenry is imperative. Social influence and persuasion are the most efficient tools to bring about change in the participation levels of people in policy implementation.

Body

Social influence is the **change in behaviour** that one person causes in another, intentionally or unintentionally. Persuasion is one of the forms of social influence. Persuasion can occur through appeals to reason or appeal to emotion. For example, school-based substance abuse prevention programs using the social influences model consistently produce better results than programs emphasizing only health information.

They are used to appeal to a person's attitude, behavior and cognition. Advertisements are the robust examples of persuasion. The government has also utilized this tool for the success of the initiatives like **Swacch Bharat Abhiyaan**, deal with issues like girl child education, **inter caste marriage**, temple entry for women, persuasion may be the only solution because change has to be brought keep intact the dignity and respect of all stake holders.

Reputation and peer pressure contribute to the desired behavioral change required for effective implementation of public policy. For example, District Collector sending his child to the government school.

They help in **Moral conditioning** i.e. Persuasion can bring change in attitude of people. In Delhi Metro various signboards on certain seats asks passengers to offer that seat to needy people. Similarly, regular announcements to keep the station clean persuade people to change their behaviour.

Conclusion

Further participatory decision making at all government level is the biggest tool for social persuasion and maintaining standards of ethics in Public administration.

Q4. (a) Nobody gets to be good at something without effort, no matter what your aptitude is. Comment. (150 words) (10)

Introduction:

The above quote highlights importance of hard work and aptitude. Both are important characteristics of the human personality, which influence one's learning, performance and behaviour.

Body

An **aptitude is a component of a competence** to do a certain kind of work at a certain level. Aptitude is inborn potential to do certain kinds of work whether developed or undeveloped.

Aptitude is related to **capability and potential**. The most fundamental element of potential is hard work. If one do not strongly attach hard work with potential in life, he/she will be sorely disappointed when they do not succeed.

This kind of naïve performance leads to a bitter and confused conclusion. Working hard leads people beyond their potential every day. In fact, talking about hard work should be promoted in every classroom and workplace in the world. Potential is nothing but an inhibitor without that connection.

Everyone is born with innate potential to achieve something in life, but it's only a few who succeed.

This is because only a few can sustain the **efforts** required towards their goal, others perish in the midway and lead a mediocre life.

Famous personalities such as Mahatma Gandhi, Thomas Edison, Albert Einstein, and Mother Teresa were successful in their fields not just because of their aptitude but their efforts and positive attitude – when their journeys became challenging, they did not give up; instead, they kept on trying till they reached their goals.

Conclusion

Talent(aptitude) is commonplace. The ability to use it and succeed is the rarest of abilities. The choice is simple. Wasting the potential or getting busy being great.

(b) The best index to a person's character is how he treats people who can't do him any good, and how he treats people who can't fight back. Comment. (150 words) (10)

Introduction:

Character is inner quality of a person which reflects from his/her behavior. As Aristotle rightly said, 'our characters are the result of our conduct'. It is built over period of time and merely possession of values will not result into a good character.

Body:

Behavior of person is a key to understand the character of person when he/she involved with people who cannot do good for him/her or with people of weaker section of society.

Humble, selfless and humane behavior with everyone equally, irrespective of anything is the indication of person with character. Indian saints like Nanak, Kabir, Tukaram lived life of such high standards of character. However whose behavior with people changes based on selfishness or element of arrogance comes in engagement with people who do not have capacity to fight back is person of low character.

It is often seen that **insensitivity, arrogance and ignorance** crops in a behavior with weaker people like waiter in hotel, domestic helper in homes and peon staff at offices. It easily highlights flaws in character of person.

Gandhiji's 'Talisman' show path for everyone who work in public interest that the action or behavior must be to gain something for weaker people and it should increase the control of person on his life or destiny.

Many times well contacted or rich or powerful person influences the behavior of government to their advantage due to various quid pro quo mechanisms. Ordinary people often face different treatment due their incapacity to reciprocate any advantage to public servants or leaders. Repressive actions on farmer's march by state machinery often come in news but political rallies which turned violent get lenient response like Panchayat election violence in West Bengal or Jat reservation violence in Haryana.

Apart from behavioral point of view, courage, truthfulness and capacity to maintain integrity with power are few other scales to measure character.

Conclusion:

Character can be built through socialization, real life experiences, reward-punishment principle and impact of role model over a period of time. Hon'ble PM Narendra Modi expressed that character is most important virtue for civil servants in his speech on occasion of civil service day. Mahatma Gandhi once said, "If wealth is lost nothing is lost, health is lost something is lost and when character is lost everything is lost."

Q5. Given below are two quotes by moral philosophers. Bring out their significance in the present societal context. (150 words) (10)

(a) "All differences in this world are of degree, and not of kind, because oneness is the secret of everything."

Introduction:

World is collage of different culture and civilizations with various colors and hues. Appearance of differences in forms like religion, ethnicity, language and beliefs in values like democracy, nationalism, communism and monarchy are clearly visible in collage but homogeneity of all colors is also underlying reality of our world.

Body:

This statement of Swami Vivekananda highlights Indian belief in the universalism. Difference is common feature of vivid beautiful world. It appear in various forms as following,

There is a broad scientific agreement that conceptualizations of race are untenable. Among humans, race has no taxonomic significance and there is no scope for belief that humans are of different races and every race has unique specialized traits. Now it is established that all living humans belong to the same species, Homo sapiens. Different religions like Christianity, Islam, Hinduism, Judaism, Sikhism, Buddhism, Jainism and Zoroastrianism said to have different way of life and conduct. But peace and non-violence is the underlying principle of every religion in the world. Every religion teaches humanity and love towards each and every living being.

Language remains one of the identical aspects of difference in today's world society. However, all languages evolved through one proto human language.

Belief system of every culture and civilization remain major difference in the current world society. Democracy and democratic values of free speech and liberty are dear to countries like United States, India, United Kingdom whereas ideas of communism and socialism are strong in china, Nepal and Russia. However every political system has common objective of service to people.

According to theory of evolution every living species started its journey from one common single cell. It asserts the underlying oneness among flora, fauna and various forces of surrounding environment.

We can easily find harmony in elements of nature and global commons like oceans, air, space in which oneness is evident. Forces of globalization continue to unite world in oneness.

Current challenges of climate change, religious extremism, reversal of globalization, xenophobia, nationalism, east-west and north-south divide of development is hurting the oneness of world society. New challenges of 21st century demand new values and ways to deal with it like global thinking, global citizenry and common habitat.

Conclusion:

There is narrow parochial view which divides world into compartments and which restrict to see interdependence of all phenomena. To see one in all and all in one is to break through the great barrier which narrows one's perception of reality.

(b) "Don't limit a child to your own learning, for he was born in another time."

Introduction:

Children are like wet clay need constant moulding to create space for wholesome development. Parental grooming is one of the essential part of child learning and it cannot be replaced but not enough; child should also have free and fair access to new knowledge of his/her own generation with new perspective and opportunities.

Body:

In this statement Rabindranath Tagore highlighted the important aspects of parenting. Every generation has its own set of challenges and they need their own unique education to deal with those challenges.

Change is the fundamental rule of the existence. Unpredictability of the change increases focus on prudence for education of children. Capacity building and empowerment focused approach of parents is a key.

Technology has increased the pace of changes happening around to the level that created kind of illusion. Technological advancements like mobile communication revolution, 4G/5G, artificial intelligence, gene editing technology and automation are changing job profiles in market which necessitates constant learning.

It also created confusion, unemployment and instability in society which increased the stress, strain and other pressures on human development. Proper meditation, strength of mind, resilience and adeptness to the changes around is the approach to deal with current problems.

There is increasing focus on career and awareness about skill development but lacking equally important focus on building moral values. Humans are thinking animals. And thinking cannot be replicated in machines to the level of human capacity. Hence it is necessary to develop moral values in children through socialization, experience, and delayed gratification. There should be respect for some basic universal values like kindness, temperance, tolerance, truthfulness, honesty and respect for elderly in children.

Conclusion:

There should be enough freedom from parents to choose different fields of knowledge based on interest, passion and aptitude. Children should not be raised or seen as a medium to accomplish unfulfilled dreams of their parents. They should get every option to choose their own course.

Q6. A good work culture is simply a shared way of doing something with a passion. Elucidate. Do government bodies lack such culture? Examine. (150 words) (10)

Introduction:

Work culture is unique set of values, ideas and belief systems shared by organization. It maintains common minimum understanding between different stakeholders regarding aims, objectives and missions of organization.

Body:

Shared way of doing something emerges from understanding of shared goals and commitment towards it. Doing something with passion requires adequate incentive behind it, which create job satisfaction and enhances performance.

Passion also comes from the right people at right position of his/her choice which is possible in corporate sector easily. Shared way of doing something with passion

requires good communication strategy focused on listening concerns of every stakeholder.

Government bodies lack such culture and are engulfed in bureaucratic type of work culture. It manifests into complacency, red tapism, nepotism, elitism etc. There is need to professionalize civil services to bring good work culture.

Government bodies acts as fragmented departments of large institution of government. Compartmentalization has created lack of awareness about shared values. They also have lot of inherent issues, such as nonprofit orientation reduces passion, overburden, lack of discipline, lethargy to accept and implement new ways of doing things, job security in government reduces competitive spirit. Leadership crisis as generalized service cadre cannot provide innovative solutions to particular problems of different departments.

However, various government bodies have resonated good work culture in different times. Independence of Election commission of India remained unquestionable under leadership of TN Seshan, autonomy of CAG reinforced under Vinod Rai.

Conclusion:

There is need to have strong leadership, more informal environment and improving behavioral competence of civil servants through sensitive training. Code of ethics need to imbibed in behavior of civil servant for proactive engagement and shared passion towards public interest.

Q7. People's indifference is the best breeding ground for corruption to grow. Do you agree? Critically analyze. (150 words) (10)

Introduction:

Corruption is defined as the abuse of entrusted power for private gain. It is generally recognized that monopoly and discretion increase the propensity to corruption while competition and transparency reduce corruption. It is considered as termite which infiltrated into lives of people.

Body:

People's indifference is example of ignorance and acceptance of corrupt practice in their various transactions with government and among themselves. It removes the feeling of resistance to the bad practice and increase belief in flawed idea that corruption help to 'grease the wheels'.

People's indifference is not reason behind corruption but impact of corruption they experience repeatedly. People tend to ignore and accept corrupt practices to save their time, money and value commitments.

Generalized acceptance of certain level of corruption in system increases the threshold of corrupt activities. For example, scams of amount up to couple of lac crores ignited anti corruption movement in India while scams of few crores no longer fetch attention of public sentiments.

Corruption and abuse of office has been aggravated by various factors along with people's indifference. First, there is a colonial legacy of unchallenged authority and propensity to exercise power arbitrarily. Second, there is enormous asymmetry of power in our society. Third, over regulation, severe restrictions on economic activity, excessive state control, near-monopoly of the government in many sectors and an economy of scarcity all created conditions conducive to unbridled corruption.

In dealing with corruption, there is overemphasis on values and character. Another approach is based on the belief that most human beings are fundamentally decent and socially conscious, but there are always a small proportion of people, which cannot reconcile individual goals with the good of society.

Anti-corruption interventions so far made are seen to be ineffectual and there is widespread public cynicism about them. The interventions are seen as mere posturing without any real intention to bring the corrupt to book. They are also seen as handy weapons for partisan, political use to harass opponents.

Conclusion:

Corruption is so deeply entrenched in the system that most people regard corruption as inevitable and any effort to fight it as futile. This cynicism is spreading so fast that it bodes ill for our democratic system itself. People's indifference is not choice of people but compulsion of systematic corruption they face.

Q8. What are your views on subsidies and caste based entitlements? Is it morally correct to tax or deprive one segment of the population and pass on the benefit to the other? Critically examine. (150 words) (10)

Introduction:

Caste based entitlements like reservations are adopted as part of affirmative action adopted in state policy in Indian Constitution. Whereas subsidies are part of government policy to help economically disadvantaged professions, poor population and bring change in traditional way of life.

Body:

State as well as government both has objective to establish equality with equal opportunities and status. Equal status before law and equal protection of law are part of fundamental rights.

Steps of positive discrimination help to establish equity in society to some extent. There is difference between equity and equality, without any state action equal opportunity is assumed as if everyone will benefit from same policy. However it cannot establish equity as same policy to everyone may not result into true realization of equal opportunities due to some fundamental issues like historical discrimination, primitive lifestyle, lack of capacity to fulfill basic needs of life etc. hence different policy to make it possible for everyone to have equal access of opportunity is equitable policy making. Subsidies and caste based entitlements are examples of such equitable policy making and absolutely necessary in societies like India.

Welfare state is moral objective of government propounded in directive principles of Indian constitution, which acts as moral compass or conscience check on decision makers. Until and unless inequality remains unaddressed in society and continue to hinder potential of different sections of society, it is moral to provide caste based entitlement. About subsidies given to poor section, It is failure of government to provide production viable prices for agricultural goods or in case of LPG subsidies it is onus on government to provide clean fuel to everyone in the country to restrict climate change and create minimum standard of life for everyone.

However, such positive discrimination cannot become permanent feature of state policy. As it may create kind of security in one section of society; may turn into lethargy towards hard work and other sections who do not get such support may feel discriminated. More taxation on rich is also disincentive to become rich. Recently increased migration of high net worth individuals from India to foreign countries for residence and citizenship is negative impact of progressive taxation.

Conclusion:

Justice is one of the cardinal virtue which necessitates non discriminatory treatment for everyone. But it is simply impossible to bring equity without removal of fundamental inequity of socio-economic and socio-cultural nature. Removal of systematic barriers in society will pave way for removal of caste based entitlement and subsidies in near future.

SECTION – B

Q9. You are a 28 year old IAS officer. You are married and last year you got blessed with a beautiful baby girl. You are posted as the personal secretary to the Governor of a northeastern State of India. The Governor is 85 years old and is suffering from several old age related ailments. On a sunny day, you accompany the Governor in a helicopter that is supposed to land in a remote district of the State. The Governor has been invited to inaugurate a hospital there. Midway towards the destination, the weather turns worse and it starts to rain with thunderstorms and high velocity winds. The pilot declares that the helicopter can crash any moment and passengers would have to jump out with the help of

parachutes. The Governor is getting uneasy and asking you to do something. You hurriedly look for the parachutes in the emergency compartment of the helicopter. However, to your surprise, you can find only one parachute there. It effectively means either you or the Governor can use the parachute. One of you will have to sacrifice the life to save the other.

What are the alternatives available to you in this situation. What decision would you take? Substantiate your decision with the help of suitable arguments. (250 Words) (20)

Stake holders involved:

- You.
- Governor.
- Pilot.
- Your family.

Ethical dilemma involved:

- Saving the life of an old age man who is holding a constitutional position in the country VS self- interest and own survival.

Alternatives available:

a. Offer the parachute to the governor:

Pros:

- Sacrifice: You would have made the ultimate sacrifice for the country by protection the life of Governor by sacrificing your life.
- Martyr: You become a martyr and your sacrifice will find its place in the history. You will become the example for service before self to future generation.

Cons:

- Family in trouble: You would leave your young spouse and daughter in deep trouble. She will have to grow in an alien environment without the one who could have her back all the time.
- Governor's safety: Governor's safety is also not assured because being a 85 years old man, seeing the height itself he might suffer cardiac attack and dies or does not know how to use a parachute and lose his life while landing.

b. Grab the Parachute for yourself:

Pros:

- Your Life: Your life is equally important as the other person and you are very young and should enjoy many things in life whereas the governor doesn't have much left for him.
- Family is safe and secure: Your family will have you and their future is safe and secure.

Cons:

- Self before service: You might be condemned across your fraternity for putting self before service and bringing shame to the service.
- Failed as protector: You will have failed to protect an unarmed and elderly man by putting your self-interest and selfishness before your dharma.
- Haunt: This incident might haunt you for the rest of your life.

Since there are only two practical options available, you can go with any one of them. Both of them can be substantiated irrespective of the option you choose.

For instance, Utilitarianism principle can be applied here. You can say, I will go with the 2nd option because, being young and having a dependable family it is not just about me alone but also other people (family) who are involved and also seeing pros and cons, the safety of governor cannot be guaranteed and both lives will be lost where at least one could have saved.

Also you can say, you will explore the option of trying to fit in the parachute to governor and yourself if such an option is available.

Note: Do not go for impractical and too ideal alternatives. Keep it practical and simple.

Q10. You are posted as a junior doctor in a hospital in a left wing extremism affected district of Central India. Violence is a norm there and you treat many injured personnel and villagers on a daily basis. One night, you receive an unusual patient in the most unusual and horrific fashion. The patient is none other than the leader of the most prominent naxal group in the district. The leader was shot in an encounter with the police and managed to flee with some of his associates. They have barged into your home, held your family members hostage and are asking you to treat the leader. They are threatening to kill your family members if you don't comply.

You immediately start treating the leader. You realise that the wound is not serious and the leader can be treated successfully. However, an idea hits you. What if you knowingly kill the leader by injecting him with excessive anaesthesia! You can always tell the associates that you tried your best but couldn't save him. In any case, the Government has put a bounty of lakhs of rupees on the leader, dead or alive. By killing him, won't you be serving the cause of the nation? But at the same time, your conscience reminds you of the oath that you took as a doctor

during your training days. Medical profession doesn't differentiate between the life of a criminal and that of a commoner!

How would you deal with this dilemma? What are the most important sources of ethical guidance in this situation Discuss. (250 words) (20)

Stake holders:

- You as a doctor.
- Your family.
- Naxal leader and his associates.

Ethical dilemma:

- Upholding the oath of office and Humanity VS service to country and doing your part for safety and security of fellow citizens.

Options available:

a. Treat the leader:

Pros:

- Upheld your professional oath: Doctors take the oath to treat everyone who comes to them without any enmity and hatred. You have done your duty and even court cannot find you guilty.
- Saving a human life: You have done a great service to humanity by saving a human life. We are no one to kill a person. Capital punishment is banned in several western countries also.
- Family: Also the safety of his family is assured.

Cons:

- Harm to society: By treating him and leaving him free, you are causing more harm to society and by saving one life, you are indirectly threatening life of innocent citizens of the country.
- Anti-National: Even though as a doctor you upheld your oath and remained true to your profession, as a citizen of country, you are equally responsible for protecting the nation and maintaining law and order.

b. Killing the leader:

Pros:

- National service: You will do a great service to nation by helping in eliminating a dreaded criminal in society. You will bring peace to thousands

of families and you will be looked upon as god by those martyr families killed by this person.

- Rewarded: The government might reward you with a medal and monetary benefits for your act.

Cons:

- Disloyal to profession: You will be held disloyal by your medical fraternity and your license can also be terminated.
- Future threat: This news might spread and the associates of followers of the leader might harm you or your family in the future.

c. Alternate option available:

- Treat him: You can treat him, by doing so you will have saved your family and be true to your profession.
- Inject a lethal dose: Also while treating inject a lethal dose in such a way it starts affecting him after some time period and he ultimately dies.
- Inform the police: While performing the treatment, you can inform the police/security personnel or after they leave immediately you can pass on the information about the treatment and its after effects.
- Side effects: Provide treatment and medicine in such a way that it will have side effects and ultimately he will need to seek future treatment which will help the security apparatus to hunt him down.

The important source of ethical guidance in this situation is of Bhagavath Geeta where Krishna paramatma, advises Arjuna to kill his Guru Dronacharya and Bhimsa pithamaha in two different instances. Here he shows that even though it is against Yudh dharma but for welfare of society, it is required and accepted.

Q11. A high end restaurant cum bar is operational in the city where you are the Superintendent of Police (SP). The owner of the place is a good friend of yours. One day, the incumbent Government puts a blanket ban on the sale, purchase and consumption of alcohol in the state by implementing a law. Now anyone found selling, purchasing, serving or consuming alcohol will be subject to penalty and imprisonment. You have been given special instructions from the state headquarters that complete vigil and enforcement must be ensured in your jurisdiction.

The very next week your friend approaches you with a request. The marriage of the local MP's son is scheduled for the weekend. There will be guests from all over the states. Your friend has been given the onus to arrange liquor for the guests. He wants you to shut your eyes for this one particular event. He even tells you that the MP has given him the assurance that no action will be taken against the authorities for the violation of the latest law. In fact the MP is insistent that the

local authorities cooperate with the management of the restaurant for smooth organisation of the event.

What options do you have in this case. Bring out the merits and limitations of the options and also tell which option will you choose and why. (250 words) (20)

Stake holders:

- You as the SP.
- Your Friend.
- Local MP.

Ethical dilemma:

- Integrity and upholding the law of land VS friendship and accepting local MP's diktat.

Options available:

a. Allow the function to go on smoothly and turn blind eye towards alcohol servings:

Merits:

- Friendship: Your friendship is still intact and stronger than ever.
- Sufficient reward: You might as well get rewarded sufficiently by your friend in cash and kind.
- Good books of MP: You will be in good books of local MP and he might treat you with rewards in form of promotion or posting when right time comes.

Demerits:

- Illegal: You have turned a blind eye for illegal activity under your jurisdiction which will remain as a black mark in your career.
- Punishment: You can be equally guilty for the crime and liable for punishment.
- Enquiry and suspension: If somebody files a case, you will have to face departmental enquiry and face suspension.

b. Do not allow for liquor to be served:

Merits:

- Integrity: You will be upholding your duty and prove your integrity towards the service and law of land.

- Set precedence: You will have set precedence to your juniors and you will be an example in future.
- Rewarded: Your commitment will be recognized and when right time comes, you can expect better opportunity in the department.

Demerits:

- Friendship: Your friendship is at risk.
- Loggerhead with MP: You will be at loggerhead with your local MP and when bad time arrives, you will have to bear the consequences.
- Transfers: You can be transferred to different location and in your place an officer who is cooperative can be posted and function might go smoothly.

c. Alternative options available:

- Request: You can request the friend to not serve any alcoholic beverages in the party and serve those that are not barred. Also tell him your inability to help him or turn blind eye.
- Change of location: You can request the local MP to change the venue of wedding to place where alcohol is served or keep marriage here and party in different place where consuming alcohol is not offence.
- Inform the authorities beforehand: You can inform the authorities beforehand and seize the alcohol and let the marriage go on peacefully.
- Provide information to media: So that even local MP would become alert and cancel the liquor to make sure his image is not tarnished.
- Go on leave: If nothing of above sort works out, you can apply for leave and go, so that you will not be held responsible. But it should be the last resort.

When everybody is hand in glove with the system, it is very difficult for one man to fight it entirely. So alternative c would be the best sort of action.

Q12. You are heading an important project in your company. Your senior has requested to take his son in the team for a short term internship of three months. You are reluctant to take a college student in such an important project and that too at a time when the deadline for completing the project is approaching. However, being junior to your boss, you accept his request and induct his son in your team. In a day only, you realise the intent and motivation of the intern. He tells you that he isn't interested in learning and that he won't be able to make any contribution to the project. In fact, he is more interested in classical music and painting. He has already enrolled for the classes and wants to utilise the internship period for honing his singing and painting skills. He tells you that his father has forced him to pursue engineering and if he doesn't obtain a certificate at the end of three months, his father would become really angry. He requests you to issue a certificate of completion of internship and get done with him. Since you have nothing to lose in this situation and you also sympathise with the son, you accede to his request.

Meanwhile, the HR vertical of the company takes a member from your team on loan for a period of three months on the assumption that the intern would assist the team during this period. You get irritated by this decision and intimate your boss about it. However, your boss is not in the mood of listening. He tells you that not only you need to part away with the team member but also impart good training to his son and extract meaningful contribution from him towards the project.

Discuss the alternatives available to you in this scenario. What decision would you take and why? Discuss. (250 words) (20)

Stakeholders:

- You.
- Your senior.
- His son.

Ethical dilemma:

- To follow the orders of senior VS conveying your inability to take his son into the team.

Alternatives available:

a. Obey your senior:

Merits:

- Good books: You will be in the good books of senior and he will reward you for your loyalty towards him with timely promotion and increment.
- Man management: You will also get experience in handling an important project without required team and non-participating team. If you succeed in this project, then you will have gained a lot of experience.

Demerits:

- Morale: The involvement of non-participative and non-serious member will affect the morale of team.
- Project completion: The completion of project might get delayed due to non-availability of complete team.
- Burden: It will become burden on other members to put extra effort in place of ex-team member who moved to different project.
- Affect the child: You forcing the child to work will affect his future dream and that guilt you will have to carry for long term.

b. Reject his request:

Merits:

- Project: The project could be completed on time.
- No-burden: There would be no extra burden on team and all will have played a role in completion with their contribution.
- Focus: You can also give complete focus otherwise u would have to provide training to intern and waste time.
- Child's passion: The child will get time to pursue his passion and not waste his time in the company.

Demerits:

- Wrath: You will have to bear the wrath of your boss for no compelling to his order.
- Affect your career: your career in the company might as well be affected as you might be overlooked during promotion and for important projects.
- Relationship: Your relationship with him might get affected and this might cause imbalance in team management and project completions.

c. Alternative option:

- Convince the child: Make the son of your senior understand about his involvement and role in the project. Convince him that his participation now can convince the father in future to allow him to pursue his goal.
- Inform the senior: Talk to senior and inform him about the needs for project and the seriousness of issue and what is at stake. Also tell him that he will solely responsible in case of any disastrous result.
- Talk to team members: Inform the team about parting of one member and involvement of intern, also inform them about the issue. So that the team as a whole can reject the intern at this project or as part of their team. So when the pressure builds up either the senior understands and takes back his son or put him in different department where his role is of less importance.

The last option is more feasible and practical. 1st first two options have their own merits and demerits where one might affect you at personal level and other at professional level. The last option is the middle path and safer option among the available options.

Q13. You have been assigned the job of assessing bids and awarding contracts for an important highway project. There are other members in your committee who would be assisting you in the job. Your team has received multiple bids and you start scanning them one by one, first evaluating the technical specifications followed by the financial bid. While scanning one of the bids, you realise that the technical specifications match perfectly with the requirements of the project and the prices quoted in the financial bid are really close to the acceptable limits. The

near perfectness of the bid creates suspicion in your mind. You discuss the same with your partners and they assure you to look into your concerns later on. However, when the day of the final award of the contract arrives, the other members unequivocally recommend that the contract be awarded to the same party. At this point of time, you are convinced that the other members must have connived with the party and shared the critical details. However, since the scope of the committee is to evaluate the bids purely on the merit of facts contained in the bid documents, the allegations of connivance and graft won't stand the scrutiny of logic. Your inner hunch has no place in the evaluation process.

What is the dilemma in this scenario? What are the options available to address this dilemma? Which one would you choose and why? Discuss. (250 words) (20)

Stakeholders involved:

- You.
- You team members.
- Contract party.

Dilemma:

- Honesty and integrity VS Antagonizing your team members.
- Accountability and Impartiality VS partisanship and favoritism.

Options available:

a. Accept the proposal:

Merits:

- Work completion: Since the job of committee is to scan purely on merit and give. You can accept the one which is so close and complete the job.
- Relationship: You will continue having good relationship with the team members and no issues.
- Reward: You can also get rewards in form of cash and kind form the bidder for clearing his proposal.

Demerits:

- Guilty: You are equally guilty for crime like your team members. Knowingly you have cleared the bid. If any mishap happens in future, you will be charged with criminal offence.
- Corruption: You have encouraged and turned blind eye to corruption in this case. Not just the bribe taker but also person who supports it is equally guilty.
- Conscience: Your conscience will not allow you to be at peace for causing such disservice to your country.

b. Reject the proposal:

Merits:

- Service to society: you will have done a great service to society by averting a major mishap in future.
- No-guilt: You will have no guilt on your shoulders and can be proud of yourself.
- Safe: You can be rest assured that no issues might come to you in future, if you would have passed this bid and some mishap happens you will be charged with criminal offence.

Demerits:

- Threat: You might be threatened by the bidder or your family might be at risk.
- Team members: Your relationship with other members of team will get affected/turn sour.
- Cost to exchequer: You will have caused additional burden on exchequer and delayed an important project.

c. Alternative options:

- Inform the anti-corruption sleuth: Inform the anti-corruption agency about your apprehensions and ask for their help to prove your doubts.
- Reject the bidder: You can reject that particular bidder and select the next best.
- Reject the entire process and recall with changed specifications: By this you may have taken extra time but rest assured that the process is complete and transparent.
- E-bidding: The renewed process can be done through e-bidding to establish transparency and accountability and check if the previous bidder was guilty or not.
- Approach media: If your request for cancellation is ignored, you can go to media with your points to bring attention of government and general public.
- Approach judiciary: You can also approach judiciary to bring a stay on the process.

It is advisable to go with the 3rd option, because even after informing you co-members about the suspicion, they are going for this particular bidder will prove beyond doubt about some fishy things about the bid. Even though it is not your role/responsibility to find out about the suspicious activity, as a law abiding citizen, you can be a whistle blower.

Q14. You are a judge in a special court constituted to adjudicate copyright cases. You have to deliver a judgement in the case of an affluent and powerful publication house which has alleged that a small town teacher has committed copyright violations. Some of the books published by the house have been photocopied and distributed amongst his students. The house has imposed a copyright violation lawsuit of Rs. One Crore against the teacher.

While adjudicating the case, you are told by the defence lawyer that the teacher is really poor and conducts classes for homeless and marginalised children who want to enter the prestigious engineering colleges of the country. Due to lack of resources, the teacher was forced to get the books photocopied as the original books would have cost much higher.

What judgement would you deliver in this case? Substantiate your judgement with suitable arguments.? (250 Words) (25)

Stake holders:

- You as judge.
- Teacher.
- Publication house.

Ethical dilemma:

- Justice and equal protection of law VS positive discrimination and societal welfare.

This is a case of copyright infringement, which is a serious offence and comes under The Copy rights act, 1957 it in the country.

Available options to you:

a. Dismiss the case:

Merits:

- Access to education: The poor and marginalized will get access to quality education.
- Fundamental right: The fundamental right under Article 21A, guarantees right to education and the teacher has not used it for any business purposes but just to educate children of marginalized sections.
- Recent law: The recent court judgement says that for education purpose if it is photocopied then it doesn't come under copy rights infringement.

Demerits:

- Affect creativity: This might affect in long term the creativity, as people will start taking things for granted when provided for free.
- Innovation: It will affect the innovation and efficiency in long run.
- Availability of quality material: In long run, foreign materials and quality materials will not be available in country as publishers might avoid selling in country due to lack of avenue for revenue.

b. Announce the teach as guilty and award punishment:

Merits:

- Equality: The rule of law and equal protection of law is upheld. People will become aware of the offences and avoid such things in future.
- Protection to creativity: There will be legal protection to creativity and it will encourage people to develop their own content.
- Punishment: The accused is punished for the offence and it sends a message to society that nobody can get away with offence citing his conditions.
- Foreign publications and world class materials: The foreign publishers and award winning authors materials will be available in the market without them needing to worry about their revenue and protection to their hard work.

Demerits:

- Access to quality education: The poor and marginalized will be restricted from having access to quality materials and education which can help them succeed in life.
- Social justice: It will be against the dream of framers of constitution where the marginalized and vulnerable sections are further deprived from the chance to empower their lives.

Among the two options available, it is better to prefer the first option because, the same judiciary which protects copy rights infringement also in its recent landmark judgement has ruled that the preparation of 'course packs' i.e. compilation of photocopies of the relevant portions of different books prescribed in the syllabus, and their distribution to the students by educational institutions does not constitute infringement of copyright in those books under the Copyright Act, 1957, as long as the inclusion of the works photocopied (irrespective of the quantity) was justified by the purpose of educational instruction.